Pilot and feasibility study: sustainability and effectiveness of results for ESF participants using CIEs

ESF Partnership meeting
Brussels, 9 October 2018
Marco Pompili – Ismeri Europa
Presentation outline

• Objective and tasks of the study
• Findings from the ‘Evaluation Helpdesk’
• Findings from the mapping phase
• Where we are now: the 4 pilots
• Next steps
Objective of the study

Learning about the potential of the available data and assessing whether CIE could be used more, identifying obstacles and proposing ways to overcome them
Helpdesk Findings: completed evaluations

• The completed evaluations focus on labour market policies, while none is concerned with education

• PSM (Propensity score matching) is the most frequently used method, while RDD (Regression discontinuity design) was never applied

• Administrative data (especially registers for the unemployed) are widely used to identify the control group

• The probability to be employed is the most frequently used outcome variable, measured 12 or more months after the completion of the operations
Findings from Helpdesk: planned evaluations

- 32 CIEs are planned in the 2014-2020 evaluation plans prepared by 16 Member States

- Half of the planned CIEs cover employment issues (Thematic Objective 8)

- Evaluation plans generally do not define the methods and data to be used in detail but identify potentially relevant administrative data.
Mapping: ESF monitoring data

- ESF monitoring data do not include information on people who applied but did not participate in the operations, in 30 cases out of 75.

- Employment status is mostly measured according to the regulations requirements, 6 months after leaving the operations. Only in 16 cases, 12 or more months after completion.

- The majority of monitoring information systems (46 out of 75) contain data on the type of activities and on the duration of operations.

- In almost all monitoring systems, a unique code is used to identify participants (not provided to third parties and data are anonymised).

- At least one month, but possibly more, is necessary to obtain ESF monitoring data.
Mapping: Administrative data on labour market issues

• Generally, the available data make it possible to identify a control group for ESF operations targeted at the unemployed

• Data which can be potentially used as control variables, such as gender, age, education (not in all cases), citizenship and residence are available

• In terms of outcome variables, the employment status of people is generally available, however in some cases more than one administrative database has to be used. Information on wages is less common

• Administrative data contain in many cases the same unique code as the ESF monitoring data; microdata are provided only in anonymised form

• The necessary time to collect administrative labour market data (2-3 months on average) is longer than in the case of ESF monitoring data
Mapping: Administrative educational data

- Administrative data on education cover both schools and students, generally until secondary education.
- In general, data are updated yearly.
- Outcome variables (e.g. number of absences and the educational performance) available in around half of the cases.
- In many cases, the unique codes used to identify people in the databases are different from those used in the ESF monitoring and information systems.
- In 4 out of 19 examined databases, the microdata are not made available for research purposes.
- In those cases in which they can be requested, at least 2 months are necessary to obtain administrative data on education.
Some relevant points

- CIE in the field of labour issues, especially for policies focusing on unemployed, is more common and feasible than in other fields.

- It is necessary to plan CIE since the programming phase, for example in the evaluation plans, which could be more detailed.

- Some relevant issues to be considered in the initial programming stage:
  - what data will be needed
  - which administrative datasets are to be used
  - whether agreements with data holders are necessary
  - identification of a clear procedure to provide data to the evaluators.
Where we are now and next steps

4 pilots were selected: Italy (Veneto) – LTU; Slovakia – LTU; Spain (Cataluña) - LTU; Belgium (Flanders) – ESL

Selection based on a combination of criteria:

• Existing operations on LTU and ESL and availability of information on the number of people who completed the operations by the end of 2016;

• Availability and quality of information on monitoring data;

• Availability and quality of information on administrative data;

• Willingness to cooperate of relevant administrations.

Field missions carried out in all selected regions (plus Estonia) in July and August

We are now interacting with the national and regional authorities to obtain data

Next steps: 16th of November Draft final report; 1st week of December Focus group; 20th of December the Final Report
## The 4 pilots, a brief description

| Region                          | Type of policy                                                                 | Target                                                                 | No. of people | Data to be used                                                                 | Progress (end of Sept) |
|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|                                                                      |               |                                                                                |                         |
| Veneto Region – Long term unemployed (LTU) | Labour services supporting active job search; Training; Internship. EUR 32 mil. | LTU; Unemployed over 50; Unemployed living alone who have to maintain other people. | 5,600 (not all LTU) | ESF monitoring data; Data on people registered in the PES COB (data on employment status) | Data obtained          |
| Slovakia – LTU                  | Paid work (from 3 to 9 months) EUR 42 mil.                                      | LTU; individuals not in regular employment during the last 12 months; unemployed people over 50 and up to 25; unemployed with low education; people with disabilities | 6,300 LTU     | Data from the unemployment register (UPSVAR); Social Insurance Agency            | The process to obtain data is almost completed |
| Cataluña Region – LTU           | A short training phase and then work experience in public employment EUR 25 mil. | LTU who do not receive any type of benefit                           | 2,200 LTU     | PES data; Social security data (gathered by PES for us)                        | The process to obtain data is on-going |
| Belgium – Early school leavers  | Courses aimed to give students the skills required to work in a specific sector and work experience EUR 20 mil. | Young people aged between 15 and 18 (25 from 01/09/2017), also ESL | 2,500 ESL     | ESF monitoring data; Education data                                             | The process to obtain data will be completed by mid-November |
The 4 pilots: work organisation

Overall coordination:
- Senior Econometrician (AP)
- Senior Economist (MP)

Veneto Region:
- Senior Econometrician (AP)
- Senior Economist (MP)
- National Expert

Slovakia Region:
- Senior Econometrician (MDC)
- Senior Economist (MP)
- National Expert

Cataluña Region:
- Senior Econometrician (HG)
- Senior Economist (SC)
- National Expert

Belgium - Flanders:
- Senior Econometrician (HG)
- Senior Economist (SC)
- National Expert
Thanks for your attention!

Marco Pompili – Ismeri Europa
pompili@ismerieuropa.com